A balanced scorecard approach to recruitment in higher education institutions.

Problem Statement: There are multiple recruitment models and methods to align the human resource requirements with mission of the organizations. A very little work has been found in utilizing Balanced Scorecard (BSC) approach to recruitment. Practices to give weightage to those jobs which actually add value to the Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) image and productivity are inadequate. Formal HR practices in HEIs regarding talent acquisition and development are miserable. Serious efforts are needed to ensure quality right from hiring faculty. Before hiring faculty an in depth study of HEIs all job should be done in general and specially those jobs must be differentiated which has greater impact on achievement of strategic goals. These strategic job families must be treated separately and researchers even said that the investments for attaining and retaining talent for these jobs should be treated in accounts as capital investments. In such a scenario BSC approach in recruitment will provide an abridged solution. The importance of HR Department in HEIs is inevitable but living in existing conditions of least developed department of HEIs in Islamabad region (especially in private sector) the BSC based recruitment model will be a great value addition.

Research Methodology: Tools and methods for improving quality of education through qualified and competent faculty are subjective in nature. Semi-structured interviews conducted to evaluate the existing recruitment methods and practices. Gaps have been identified with respect to operationalizing mission and vision of HEIs. A generalized model for recruitment objectives (in consultation with HODs) has been suggested covering concept of strategic alignment concept of BSC. Minimum two HODs of every HEI has been interviewed to validate the information collected and compared with higher education commission quality education policies/procedures and guidelines.

Results: Based on the interviews conducted Critical Internal Processes (CIPs) and Jobs of greater strategic influence i.e Strategic Job Families (SJFs) identified. A Recruitment model proposed which translate mission of HEIs into recruitment to ensure quality education right from hiring faculty.

Originality / Value: The quality of intended learning outcomes can be determined through relevant faculty and professionals hiring. Faculty role in service learning culture promotion and in other critical processes is inevitable. This study gives a true picture of effectiveness of recruitment in pursuing the short and long term goals of HEIs. Recommended model is a lens for looking at millennial generation’s education and research requirements and a framework to cope up with them in context with fierce
global competition. In addition to recruitment strategy development the proposed recruitment model based on critical job families and critical skills set is a guideline for HR department in formulating faculty development, and reward & recognition programs.

Key Words: Critical Internal Processes, Strategic Job Families, Recruitment, Balanced Scorecard, Quality Assurance Agency, Quality Enhancement Cell

INTRODUCTION

In evolving world of science and technology, it is important for every nation to assess human development needs and equip with the necessary tools and skills to cater the contemporary challenges of knowledge based economy. HEIs are supposed to impart quality education in the workforce of nation. Balanced Scorecard (BSC) approach in recruitment of faculty identified the critical processes in strategic management, strategic job families (SJFs), and competency profiles for success of HEIs. The approach bridged the competency gap through faculty recruitment and development programs. This also synchronizes recruitment objectives with vision and mission of higher education institutions.

Generalized Critical Internal Processes and Strategic Job families for HEIs in Islamabad / Rawalpindi region provide a strategic direction towards achievement of strategic goals while recruiting faculty members. Higher Education Commission (HEC) guidelines and manuals consulted to evaluate the synchronization between mission of HEIs and HEC and to classify common balancing mechanisms. The focus was on critical internal processes (CIPS), strategic job families (SJFs) and critical competencies (CCs). A recruitment model based on Balanced Scorecard (BSC) approach is recommended that ensures faculty readiness to execute CIPS.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Roman philosopher, Seneca, said “there is no favorable wind for those who do not know where they are going”. (Clark B., 2001) Balanced Scorecard (BSC) application in management ensures that all the operational activities are towards the direction set by the stakeholders of the organization. BSC management system has been adopted in many business concerns round the globe and they become successful in speeding up their growth at institutional and national level. A growing trend of adoption of BSC has been seen in higher education management in many countries round the globe. Higher education in Pakistan is facing many challenges from stakeholders. Re-alignment of purpose of higher education with national requirements is dire need of time. This study is a foundation stone for application of BSC in education sector of Pakistan.

Higher Education sector in Pakistan is lacking in adopting the unified performance management system (Akhtar & Kalsoom). Critical success factors of HEIs without understanding the impact of social relationships with external stakeholders are invalid.

Education in Universities is different than earlier levels of School education. Learning to serve is the theme of university education. It provides high level of skill set required to perform practically and also the training needed for lecturers, surgeons, nurses, public servants, engineers, humanists, businesspersons, researchers, social scientists, and a numerous other personnel. These are the professions which play their role in speeding up the economy of country. They also influence government and influence community decisions. (MH Ullah et. al)
Challenges for Higher Education Institutions

The Higher Education area is confronting a serious challenge concerning supply and demand of qualified and talented graduates to the industry (Chen S.H. et al., 2006). The real address on the universities from industry is "after graduation people have just the bookish knowledge and subsequently unable to perform well in industry. (Chen S.H. et al., 2006), (Umashankar & Dutta., 2007).

International competition in educational services has become more intense, many countries have invested enthusiastically in research and higher education. Strong competition that has come with membership of the World Trade Organization (WTO), and there is an immediate requirement to explore the new recruitment processes and practices that may improve the resultant quality of Research and education. (Chen S.H. et al., 2006)
Focus of higher education is service learning to satisfy their faculty, students and other stakeholders. Pressure from community is that HEIs should produce graduates who can be beneficial for serving community and concurrent needs of country. Projects and research work conducted in HEIs should address issues of community. (Bringle & Hatcher., 2000) (Bringle & Hatcher., 1996)

Balanced Score Card

The essential start of the Balanced Scorecard is that only measuring financial results is not appropriate for judging the overall performance of any organization. (Karathanos & Karathanos., 2005) At the end of the day changes in financial output will unable to locate the reasons for improvement or decline in profit. Kaplan and Norton recommended that organizations using only monetary measures are basically ignoring other important business activities that have a great significance on growth of the organization. They inferred that measure ought to be created to four perspectives of organization. (Karathanos & Karathanos., 2005), (Kaplan & Norton., 1996)

1. The financial perspective; measures in this point of view may as well answer the inquiry, "How if we seem to our stakeholders?"
2. The Customers Perspective. These measures may as well answer the inquiry, "How if we seem to our clients?".
3. Internal Business Process Perspective. These measures may as well answer the inquiry, "What forms must we outperform at?
4. Learning and development Perspective. These measures may as well answer the inquiry. "By what means would we be able to maintain our capacity to change and improve?"

Three Educational Institutions in US won Malcolm Baldridge Quality Education Award in 2001 who has adopted Balanced Scorecard Management System. (Karathanos & Karathanos., 2005) Standards of Quality education covered in Baldridge Award have a clear relation with perspectives of BSC. Adopting BSC in education sector of Pakistan will ensure the quality enhancement as per international standards. A considerable agreement of universities is upon that they link the on theoretical learning with real world practical requirements by imparting knowledge, skills and abilities into their graduates.(Ryan G., et al., 1996)

Human Capital Readiness

Human Capital required in Organizational Capacity perspective of BSC identifies critical internal processes and critical skills set then required to execute the critical internal process. These skill sets
Human capital readiness is a process to identify the critical job families necessary to execute the core functions of organizations and derived from strategy of organizations. The critical job families are weighed more than other jobs performed to streamline the operations of organizations. (Kaplan & Norton., 1996)

**Figure 1: Human Capital Readiness Model (Kaplan & Norton 1996)**

Above model help to identify and weigh the importance of each critical job in pursuance of overall organizational objectives.

**Using Balanced Scorecard in Higher Education Sector – Global Context**

The researchers give a four point recommendations for improving quality of education and research at higher level. i.e sustained financial support, clearly differentiated academic system, managerial reforms with effective administration and merit based hiring of faculty and selection of students (Umashankar & Dutta 2007). They used Balanced Scorecard approach to measure the performance of university management, to improve the quality of educational degrees.

India is also facing quality education decline from post partition till now and facing the same problems of strategic drift. Producing quality research and education is inevitable for improving long term developmental rate of any country. (Chen S.H. et al., 2006)

In Taiwan there was a problem discussed by Shaun and his research fellows that after signing WTO a vast increase in number of universities has been seen but at the same time Quality of Education has been neglected hence the results were on the negative side. The research outputs due to such expansions are not adequate with the national requirements. (Kaplan & Norton., 1996)

Same is in the scenario of Pakistan we are raising the numbers of universities and publications but unable to match the outcomes with our national requirements in research and development sector.

American Association of University Professors (AAUP) is now shifting from individual targets and achievement system. They proposed “tenure by objectives”, they are again adopting probation period evaluations and even annual reviews of faculty members. These reviews are now linked with the achievements of departmental objectives and achievements. Solo flights are now becoming and old fashion (O’Meara, K.A 2000) (Shah, D. 2003). Tenure by objective has already been adopted by some
universities in United States. Modifications to conventional full time faculty hiring have been seen in US to become more industrial oriented.

Visiting faculty play a vital role in development of curriculum. (Jamil, B.R., 2009) help students in picking the applied research problems and increase industrial collaborations. BSC approach applied as in Figure below shows a clear direction of the institute and gives a picture of concrete performance measurement system.

**Higher Education Management in Pakistan**

The Focus of Higher Education Commission for continuous development of economics addressed issues including but not limited to following:-

1. Faculty Development
2. Quality Assurance
3. Research, Innovation & Entrepreneurship
4. Excellence in Leadership, Governance & Management
5. Increasing alliance between industry and university research (Neave, G. 1988)

All the aforesaid issues are directly or indirectly related with performance of faculty. Level of faculty competency is the only surety for accelerating in the focus areas. It’s a management drawback that we spending but not measuring the impact on the society as a whole.

The issues with Governance of Higher Education in Pakistan have been addressed in many research articles. The need of time is to seriously address and transform quality education while selecting ingredients/mentors that ensure quality in education. (Neave, G., 1988) (Saeed, M. 2007)

The problems including financial, management, administrative, quality of research and goals setting, achievement and measurement system is inevitable to make higher education effective and cost effective. (Perveen, A. et al). Academicians and even people working at senior positions in HEIs highlighted the importance of recruitment of faculty and impact of bad recruitment practices in Pakistan. To groom millennial generation, faculty development programs synchronized with the global industrial requirements should be ensured.

Most of Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in Pakistan are registered as Non Profit Organizations. Hence, they need to operate in a way to cater their operational expenses and maintain research labs and infrastructure. Research has been conducted to shift the existing nonprofit business model to entrepreneurial model in such a way that vision of the HEIs remain the same while using balance scorecard. (Clark, B. 2001)

Aligning each activity of business from bottom to top and measuring their results, reduce resource wastage and improve efficiency (Neave, G., 1988). First one of Nine Principals of Quality Assurance Processes (Batool & Qureshi, 2007) addresses the customer needs and defines customers of HEIs as Students, Society and Labor Market. The core concept of total quality if we apply here then all the objectives we set according to our customer’s requirements.

The 2nd principle indirectly seeks to integrate vision to the strategy for attainment of success. Hence emerging trends for adoption of BSC would be appropriate if used to as Performance Management and
Measurement System in Higher Education. This research would be a great help for HEIs in executing there on-floor activities linked with vision of the institute.

The Selection of right candidate according to the quantified objectives having concrete cause and effect relationship will guarantee the speediest pace of economic development of Pakistan Statistics of HEI’s in Pakistan. (NEMIS-AEPAM Pub. No. 244. 2011)

- Total number of universities in Pakistan is 135. Public sector universities are 76 whereas 59 are working under supervision of private sector.
- Students under studies enlisted in public sector universities are 1.108 Million out of which 86% are in Public Sector Universities and 14 % in private.
- Total instructors are 63557 out of which 50,260 (79%) are in Public Sector while 13,297 are in private universities.

Higher Education Commission of Pakistan – Progress View 2010-2011

To meet the requirements of qualified faculty for higher education in Pakistan and to boost research activities matching with international standards, HEC Sent 5000 Scholars abroad for M.S, Ph.D and Post-Doctoral research in the year 2010-2011 out of which 2375 have finished adequately and return once again to serve Pakistan. In addition, 4874 Scholars were chosen under Indigenous Scholarship program out of which 695 have finished their Ph.Ds from Universities in Pakistan. Notwithstanding above emulating facts has been gathered. (HEC Annual Report 2010-11)

- HEC Recognized Journals reaches reached to 174
- 475 Fresh Ph.Ds. sent to Public / Private Universities under 1 year Interim Placement Scheme.
- 58 Public Sector Universities have adapted Tenure Track System.
- More than 300 foreign professors from leading international universities/institutions have been hired by HEC under Foreign Faculty Hiring Program (FFHP)

FFHP improved the quality of faculty in Pakistan. However, for long term requirement of professors in academia can only be fulfilled by developing indigenous talent and giving them right directions in the best interest of academic institutions and consequently in the interest of nation.

Quality Enhancement Cell

Quality Enhancement Cell (QEC) of Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) of HEC introduced scorecard system to evaluate the performance of QECs in different HEIs of Pakistan. Till now QEC established in 83 HEIs and primarily responsible for operationalizing the quality assurance measures in institutional level. (Khwaja A. A. et al)

The procedure followed by QEC help institutes to form teams having members from programs at program level quality assessment and for Institute level there are Assessment Teams comprising of experienced relevant program specialists.

The prime responsibility of assuring quality education is the responsibility of institute itself. So why not go for taking initiatives for assuring quality by operationalizing vision which mostly talks about
quality directly or indirectly. This will not only help the institutes to fulfill requirements of HEC but also give them competitive edge over the rivals.

Recruitment

Recruitment refers to the methodology of advertising, screening, selecting, and on-boarding a qualified individual for work. The phases of the recruitment involved: Job analysis, Advertisement, Shortlisting, Interviewing, Selection and Placement, (Smith et. al 2004) (Beard D.F 2009) Contingent upon the size and area of the organization, recruitment activity may be conducted by founder of organization, HR Manager, Head Hunting Organization or recruitment agents . (Smith et. al 2004) (Ball, S.J. 2007). Recruitment is a methodology of selecting the most suitable personnel for vacant position. Hiring the right persons having the job/organizational fit remain a challenge to the businesses.Merit based hiring give guaranteed success and improve rate of productivity (Beard D.F 2009).

Recruitment Process: Five C Model (Rahman M. 2001)

![Five C Model](image-url)  

**Figure 2 Faculty Recruitment Process. Five C Model**

Five C Model was actually developed to recruit faculty for online programs but can be implemented for on-campus recruitment of faculty. Three staged five C recruitment process is a chronological progression model. The three steps may overlap sometimes, but can’t be shortened. Before hiring a faculty member he must be informed about the Mission and Vision of Institute. Thus, communicating purpose may help him at the first to align his priorities with Institutional Goals. The originator of the aforesaid model used communication as briefing regarding importance of teaching in general.

In second stage for convincing a faculty member two modes to influence were suggested

a) Conciliatory:
b) Contending

In said model both modes are essential and work fine in applicable situations. Consummating refers to facilitate once a faculty member hired to make him productive. Though the model has some relevance with recruitment process but it’s difficult to quantify the value of incumbent with respect to goal strategy of Institution.
Human Resource Planning and Analysis Model (HRPAM)

Human Resource Planning and analysis model supports by identifying current state of competencies and vision/values competencies. A fully functional HR department is required to perform all functions of this model. HRPAM is a useful model to identify gap of competencies but focus of strategic importance of different jobs performed in any organization is missing in this model.

![Figure 3: Strategic Human Resource Planning and analysis model](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Strategic_human_resource_planning)

Using BSC Approach in Recruitment

Using Balanced Scorecard in recruitment for HEIs helped the administration of HEIs in work dissection, target setting and in converting the organizational mission in departmental and individual’s objectives. It seems that after implementing BSC in HEI the role of HEIs will be more of a profit making organizations. But European universities have been working to become more enterprising and entrepreneurial and adapting BSC in full or BSC concepts in setting and pursuing their nonprofit goals. (Clark B.R 1998) Recruitment aligned with the organization's vision and mission can enhance the satisfaction level of staff. Satisfied employees enhance productivity of organizations. Working conditions, management behavior and adequate pay package and benefits have strong positive impact on employee’s motivation to work. (Malik et al. 2010) It is important to ensure quality education that the core theme behind establishment of HEIs should be reflected in recruitment of faculty and their promotion during service with the HEI. The quality should also be prominently seen while developing curriculum. (Clark B. 2001)
Requirement for BSC based Recruitment System

In the light of literature review it has been observed that a unified system is required to invent or synchronies following key parameters in human resource management of higher education sector in Pakistan

1. Strategic Job Families and respective recruitment & retention programs
2. Critical competencies and their value in achievement of Goals.
3. Quality of Education and recruitment and of faculty to enhance quality.

Excessive enrollments and inadequate human and material resources are the main factors of declining quality of higher education in Pakistan. (Akhtar & Kalsoom) Recruiting right talent actually develop core competence of organizations. Higher Education is primarily an intellectual business where minds play their role for long term results. Recruiters must be well aware of significance of recruitment process, objectives. Human Resource Managers must be capable of aligning individual’s targets with organizational vision and mission.

Using Balanced Scorecard in Education sector is an emerging trend. Balancing activities with mission and vision helps in setting measuring and achieving targets. Unfortunately here in Pakistan we are still unable to adopt a unified performance management system. Unavailability of balanced Performance Management System (PMS) is adversely affecting our recruitment and management practices and ultimately productivity of HEIs.

Pressure on Higher Education Institution is increasing from Students, Industry, Community, Staff and Funding bodies like Government and Industry Sponsors. A major shift since last decade has been seen in academia regarding industrial orientation in curriculum development and research work. A marathon of getting high ranking from HEC and international ranking bodies has been seen.

Dimensionless efforts made to achieve ranking and attracting students and funding. Glamorous events and galas arranged to attract youth in universities. Research for the sake of publishing papers conducted. We rarely see a research model published and same is adopted in Industry of Pakistan. Final Year Projects at undergrad level are selected for the sake of fulfilling academic requirement of degree. However some serious efforts are now going on to pick industrial problem and giving them solution developed by students which help HEIs to ensure on-campus recruitment on graduation and to attract funding. We need to address contemporary challenges while going for recruitment so that strategic balance can be ensured in all levels of management and operations of HEIs.

A final word from HEC on Recruitment of Faculty

HEC Pakistan raised the importance of Recruiting Procedure in a training report on self-assessment procedure for programs in universities of Pakistan. Highly qualified faculty recruitment procedure should be very clear and promotions and retention policies must be in accordance with the DAI’s mission statement. The process is capable of identifying gaps in performance and goals at any instant of time.
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Recruitment process lies under the Organizational Capacity (OC) perspective of Balanced Scorecard. An organization must identify the existing Human Capital Readiness and then recruit individuals to ensure success of their strategy. OC improvement considered as improvement in: competence and quality. Competence improves productivity which includes consumption of resources to achieve some targets.

Every activity performed in any organization has its importance in pursuance of mission of the organization. But some of the jobs are have strong significance on other. These core jobs have great impact on success of the organization. The strategic management differentiates these critical jobs from other less valued jobs. This process is called Human Capital Readiness (HCR). To measure HCR executives of the company with the help of management consultants identify critical processes within strategy map of organization and then identify those strategic job families (SJFs) which have superior impression on execution of these processes.

Next is the skill sketching for these job families, a comprehensive, documented detail of requirements to execute these jobs. Organizations then identify the competency gap through measurement of current capabilities and requirements for SJFs. SJFs normally have very little proportion in total of jobs performed in any organization but have greater impact on strategy.
Figure 4: BSC-HCRM Based Recruitment Model for Faculty Hiring in HEIs
Mission Statement

In HEIs mission statement is developed to formulate a generic strategic path. It is the reason to existence of HEIs. The mission statement defines the areas of interest and focus in Higher Education. The action planes and overall goals are settled in the light of mission statement. The creation of Mission Statements of HEI’s involves the Internal and External stakeholders. The interest of both Internal and External stakeholders should be clearly expressed in the Mission Statement of HEIs.

External Stakeholders

Government and Govt. backed governing and advisory bodies: Govt. and its bodies which govern and monitor the activities of HEIs primarily ensure that whatever is given by Govt. to HEIs is used in the best interest of country.

Industry: Industry refers here as those who are generally do not involve in the operations of HEIs but are the beneficiaries of what HEIs produces. HEI’s produces students and research work which are mobilized in industry.

Community: Now a day a great concern is to ensure that community concern should be reflected in the HEIs mission statement. All the activities should have a positive impact for general community of the country.

Internal Stakeholders

Internal Stakeholders are those who directly get benefit from the activities of any HEI. A comprehensive mission statement should reflect whatever they bring to the internal stakeholders. Operational strategies are normally influenced by internal stakeholders. The internal stakeholders include.

Management: University Management who actually operationalize the mission into action formulates strategy to achieve the goals of HEIs. Mission statement is actually formulated by founders and developed by the top management of Institute.

Faculty: Faculty actually eals with the students and involves in the research work for the external stakeholders and is a vital part of HEIs. A competent faculty is the only source to satisfy the soul of mission statement of any HEI.

Students: Students and Researchers can be quoted as the products of HEIs who are delivered to external stakeholders. The level of satisfaction of external stakeholders depends on quality of research and quality of graduates, which can be ensured through effective management, faculty and all the operations of HEIs.

Strategy Map

Strategy Map is a chart of goals established to achieve with and through the resources of organization. BSC based strategy maps further describe the quantifiable objectives and measures to analyze the achievement of goals. All the requirements are actually derived from the strategy map.
Critical Processes.

These processes are the part of strategy implementation which have the greatest impact on operations of the organization. These processes are the drives of organization’s prosperity and growth. At process level these processes are the reflection of operationalization of organizations mission statement.

Non Critical Processes

These are those processes which actually help to streamline functioning of critical processes execution. Like operational support, human resource etc.

Non-Strategic Job Families

In human capital readiness measurement one may describe the non-strategic job families performed to execute the non-critical internal processes. These job families may not directly affect the achievement of mission of the organization but may affect the functioning of critical internal processes.

Strategic Job Families

Every task performed in any organization is important but some jobs have vital importance in pursuance of mission of organization. Identifying those critical jobs which are more valuable in strategic management and its output is called Human Capital Readiness. The organizations have to identify critical internal processes in organizational capacity of strategy map and derive critical competencies and existing profiles of respective jobs and develop a human development program in accordance with mission of organization.

Competency profiling

In HEIs the critical competencies are those which require producing competent students and researchers and research work which are mentioned in the mission statement of the DAI. Like Management, Engineering or any other discipline. HEI’s require differentiating these core competencies from other competencies to give proper weightage and strategic focus. Human Capital Readiness Model (Kaplan & Norton 1996) implementation in recruitment in HEIs will give a strategic boost for pursuance of mission of HEIs.

Required Capabilities

Here the requirement of talent or competencies required to perform strategic job families in existing situation or for futuristic scope. Identification Human Resource for execution of SJFs is very critical where BSC experts or management consultants are hired and give consultancy to the top management. Strategic Human Resource planning is another management process which is particularly deals with this area. Since BSC is a complete management and measurement system that’s why the part of recruitment must be in line with the BSC model and ultimately with mission of the organizational strategy.
Current Capabilities

These are the capabilities exist in the HEIs. To accelerate progress HEIs must identify first the current capabilities and then process for further recruitment or right talent to meet the growing challenges of teaching millennial generation.

Competency Gap

The Competency gap is the difference between existing talent and the competencies required to meet the strategic objectives somewhere in future. This gap ensure the translation of mission into actions; the sole of Balanced Scorecard.

Balanced Human Resource Requirement

The faculty hired after satisfying all the above processes in the best extent can ensure the profligate pace of growth of HEIs. The development programs for faculty skills and competencies may be developed to mobilize the potential. By following the whole process right talent may be acquired according to the strategic vision and mission of organization. Hence the incumbent will have a balance of with the targets he will have to achieve.

Research Objectives

Almost all the HEIs mobilize their full time permanent or part-time/visiting faculty members in executing critical processes. All the critical processes, SJFs and even competency profiling (defined in forthcoming tables) are affected, directly or indirectly by faculty members. Hence it is very critical to adopt a balanced recruitment approach.

After going through the extensive literature review and interviews with HODs of HEIs in Islamabad region following processes are identified as critical for existence and further growth of department and HEIs.

1. To develop a BSC based recruitment model for faculty hiring.
2. To identify Critical Processes for HEIs in accordance with HEC QEC and QAA guidelines for recruitment and retention of faculty.
3. To Identify Strategic Job Families (SJFs) for HEIs in Islamabad Region and suggest competency profiling.

Research Design

The research conducted regarding application of BSC in recruitment was descriptive in nature. Hence, semi-structured interview approach used to extract the actual issues with recruitment of faculty. Though application of BSC is well known but using BSC model in recruitment was a new concept hence and require detail briefing (normally required in HODs case) on subject.
Books, Case studies and different manuals of HEC and university guidelines were studied. Interviews conducted in the light of scholarly written articles and material available on critical internal processes, strategic job families and competency profiles for HEIs.

**The approach of Semi Structured Interviews**

The vision and mission of HEIs varies from institute to institute. Using one specific questionnaire might not be helping to extract the relevant information regarding the particular institute. The interviewer was given open space to discuss about the subject and its application. To stick with the respective topic following areas has opened to interviewers.

1. Quality and Quality Enhancement
2. Teaching process
3. Curriculum Development
4. Performance Management
5. Recruitment of Faculty
6. Approaches of Recruitment
7. Performance Scorecards
8. Talent Management
9. How to ensure strategy compliance in recruitment.

Mission & Vision of HEIs in Rawalpindi / Islamabad

Vision and Mission Statements of the HEIs selected from Islamabad / Rawalpindi region were examined and questions were conceptually translated into strategic mission to keep the discussion narrowed with the contemporary recruitment approaches in a specific HEI while interviewing. The role of HODs was examined. These roles are as under:-

i) Workload distribution
ii) Job Analysis.
iii) Initiation of Faculty Requisition Forms
iv) Role as convener of Interview session
v) Formation of Interview panel
vi) Technical Interviews.
vii) Human Resource Planning and development

Departments Selected

Management, Engineering Management, Different Engineering programs, Environmental Sciences, computer Sciences, medical sciences and Business Administration departments were selected to examine the approaches of recruitment. HODs of management were comparatively deeper to understand and respond in the areas of recruitment and BSC approach in performance in recruitment. A wholesome idea of HODs from different backgrounds adopted to formulate the critical processes and job families.

Semi-Structured Interviews with HR Officials

HR professionals of the same HEIs were contacted to explain the recruitment processes. They also helped to identify their recruitment objectives. Performance and Job Analysis methods applied in the HEIs. Scorecards in different forms are adopted in HEIs like in Performance Evaluation Forms and Student Feedback etc. Training and development processes were also discussed. Specifically HR department in some institutes were not established but activities are performed by Registrar’s directorate or operation departments.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

Human Capital Readiness measurement is inevitable to initiate recruitment process. While initiating recruitment process in Higher Education Institutions critical internal processes must be clear to ensure recruitment in line with mission of the institution. Proposed Recruitment Model in this study which ensures compliance to mission of the HEIs as well as help to perform critical internal processes. The processes identified in this study are generalized to the sample understudy and applicable to selected
HEIs specifically. In addition to the strategy plane derived from Mission and Vision of the institute it is important to synchronize operations of HEIs with HEC. HEC gives guidelines to HEIs and play advisory role in education development in the country. It is important to understand and transform these guidelines into all level of operations generally and particularly in recruitment of faculty. Faculty is the source of developing intended learning outcomes. Critical internal processes tabulated below are observed from interviews and literature review with explanation.

Critical Internal processes derived from Literature Review and Interviews

Critical processes listed in table below were constructed from extensive literature reviews. References are given for each of the processes. The referred articles are explained in literature review chapter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Critical Internal Processes</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Bringle &amp; Hatcher., 1996) (Stephen J. L 2011) [Interviews]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Stephen J. L 2011) [Interviews]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Stephen J. L 2011) (Khwaja A. A. et al) [Interviews]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Research/Innovations</td>
<td>(Ball, S.J 2007) (Akhtar &amp; Kalsoom) (Batool &amp; Qureshi 2007) (Bringle &amp; Hatcher., 2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Akhtar &amp; Kulsoom) (Ryan G. et al. 1996) (Batool &amp; Qureshi 2007) [Interviews]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Bringle &amp; Hatcher., 2000) [Interviews]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Critical Internal Processes (Literature Review)

Teaching Process

Teaching process means the relevant teaching process which may include lectures, assignments, projects, simulations etc. Normally HEIs of private sector focus on some special areas like Engineering, Sciences or Humanities etc. Every institution tends to differentiate their core disciplines as per their mission statements. Major Lott of students joins university due to the core strengths of university.
Hence focusing on specific jobs having great strategic influence on overall achievement of goals is necessary to utilize financial and human resource judiciously. Spending incurred on development should be treated as capital investments.

**Curriculum Development**

Industrial professionals require graduates having skills to resolve their practical problems. There is a slackness of what is taught in HEIs and industrial requirements. Curriculum design and development process is very critical. The real world requirements should be incorporated in curriculum. Industry professionals are now working with HEIs as visiting or part time faculty members and bringing industrial problems to HEIs as real research problems. Moreover, the curriculum re-shaping and continuous improvement become possible.

**Quality Enhancement**

Industrial collaborations are now very important to enhance productivity and commercialization of Intended Learning Outcomes. Final year projects or research work needs some financial or material resources in many cases. HEIs needs to hire people who can develop and improve industrial linkages. This is a way to make a win-win situation for both HEIs and Industry.

**Industrial Collaborations**

Research / Innovations are expected from society, public authorities and all the other stakeholders of HEIs. Research not merely means the number of publications but it means an addition to the R&D work going in the country. R&D outputs must be real issue which impact the economy of the country. The benefit of research output should be seen in society in general and specifically the targeted audience of the research work. Selection of audience should be from stakeholders of HEIs.

**Research/Innovations**

Whether it is Human Resource Management or Recruitment & Retention or Performance Management BSC-Based HCR model can help to streamline all these processes. On one hand Balanced Scorecard give quantified results of performance and at other hand BSC-Based HCR model will differentiate strategic job families from non-strategic to make financially and strategically wise decisions.

**HRM, Performance Management Recruitment & Retention**

Successful execution of all the aforesaid critical internal processes actually based on the competitiveness of the faculty, researchers and other relevant staff and coordination mechanism between all these processes. While practicing BSC-HCR model HEIs must consider the relevant critical competencies and tabulate them to identify the competency gaps and hire employees accordingly. Human Resource Department make directory of jobs in HEIs and keep it up to date according to changes in strategic management of HEIs. BSC is not only a measurement system but it is a comprehensive management system as well. This would appropriate if BSC based management launched in management of HEIs.
Critical Internal processes from HEC QEC Scorecard, Quality Assurance Manual

Quality of education varies from time to time and it is a chain from international and national requirements at macro level to micro level at HEIs, Industry and a project requirements.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Critical Internal Processes</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>University Internal Process</td>
<td>(HEC Annual Report 2010-11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Stakeholder’s Focus</td>
<td>(Performance Scorecard QEC of QAA of HEC Pakistan 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Quality Enhancement</td>
<td>(Batool &amp; Qureshi 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Hiring and Improvement in Quality Faculty</td>
<td>Faculty Appointment Criteria HEC Pakistan (MH Ullah et. al)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Learning and Research</td>
<td>(Akhtar &amp; Kulsoom) (NEMIS-AEPAM Pub. No. 244. 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Curriculum Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>HEIs Vision and its contribution to society</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Internally Focused Quality Culture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Critical Internal Processes (HEC)

University Internal Process

University Internal processes have a great significance on performance. These processes include Admissions, Registrations, Marketing & promotions and others. An HEI addressing these issues in their strategic planes may improve the attraction for the quality students, faculty and all other stakeholders.

Stakeholder’s Focus

Stakeholder’s interest represented in the mission & vision statements of HEIs and also influences other internal processes.

Quality Enhancement

Quality is evolving with the global technological advancements and growing needs of knowledge based economies. It includes not only the hands on skills on some tool but a graduate of HEI must keep a character to influence society as well. HEC focus is to implement Quality Enhancement Cell in all the DAIs of Pakistan. Hence quality is now very critical to get the DAI ranked on top.

Hiring and Improvement in Quality Faculty

HEC primarily focusing on Quality Enhancement in Education sector in line with the requirements of knowledge based economy. To ensure quality enhancement practices HEC quality manuals and QEC processes covers the importance of quality of faculty in the relevant areas as given in the mission and vision of the institution.
Learning & Research

Learning and research explained in HEC manuals is same as explained in scholarly available literature on the subject.

Curriculum Development

Curriculum Development process in HEC manuals is same as explained in scholarly available literature on the subject and give in table 3.

Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs)

Intended learning outcomes (ILO) is somehow a target but setting Learning outcomes and pursuing them is a process. Intention of teaching or research should be measureable and relevant skill set must prevail in HEIs to make intended learning outcome exist.

HEIs Vision and its contribution to society

As per HEC quality guidelines while developing vision and mission for HEIs the social concern must be included and definitely this will include in strategy map of HEIs.

Internally Focused Quality Culture

Culture always belongs to people. When talk about culture in HEIs it refers to a culture where people of all relevant professions (required as per strategic vision) must be there or at least skill set required to develop a quality education culture can be groomed. Competencies required establishing a quality culture must be clearly differentiated and incorporated in recruitment programs.

Both tables were combined and these processes are translated into the strategic job families. Strategic Job Families for above critical internal processes in based on the interviews with HODs and Head of Recruitment Department/Team of HEIs are as under:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Strategic Job Families</th>
<th>Competency Profiles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Learning &amp; Research</td>
<td>Relevant Faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Quality Enhancement</td>
<td>Quality Analyst</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Curriculum Development</td>
<td>Education Management &amp; Integration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Faculty Recruitment &amp; Retention</td>
<td>HR Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Industrial Collaborations</td>
<td>Communication &amp; Contracting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Service Learning Culture Development</td>
<td>Conceptual &amp; Technical</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Common in Table 1 & 2

Most of HEIs in private sector in selected region get all the strategic and non-strategic job done through faculty members. Hence they prefer to seek the incumbent having all above capabilities. This is might be the reason due to which HEIs are not accelerating except increasing number of publications and graduates.
Observation

Interestingly diversification in faculty or in students enrolled is not considered as critical factor for enhancing quality and giving international exposure to students and faculty. However, during interviews almost all the HODs were agree to include diversification factor both in hiring of faculty and in recruiting students in universities but in practice it is still missing.

CONCLUSION

The objective of this study is to develop a balanced scorecard based recruitment model for faculty hiring. The proposed model can operationalize the BSC approach by filing the competency gap. Existing capabilities and competency profile required to excel in critical internal processes ensure a balance for success. To establish long term growth culture in higher education institutions strategic job families has been identified for initiating recruitment process. Course load sharing cannot alone ensure success of HEIs. It is important to know the competency gap and required strength to fill this gap. The generalized strategic job families identified in this study can help to excel in the directions set in the mission of HEIs.

Application of proposed critical internal processes and recruitment may be limited to the HEIs studied and observed in this study. Any other recruitment model may bring different results. The HCRM numeric values are not given due to limited information regarding these figures.

Focusing one specific HEI and obtaining the faculty statistics is recommended to obtain exact values of Human Capital Readiness. Moreover, Govt. Higher Education Policies and their impact on Strategy Map of organization can be examined to further integrate the education performance system with national objectives.

FUTURE RESEARCH RECOMMENDATIONS

Future research areas derived from this study are recommended as below:-

i) Case study method is recommended to apply BSC Based Recruitment Model in one Higher Education Institute.
ii) Employer feedback mechanism may be designed to evaluate the change in quality of students in comparison with the change in quality of faculty.
REFERENCES


http://www.hec.gov.pk/InsideHEC/Divisions/QALI/QADivision/Pages/EligibilityCriteria.aspx


